



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL [info@mtc.ca.gov](mailto:info@mtc.ca.gov)  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

**PLANNING COMMITTEE  
MEETING OF MARCH 13, 2009  
MINUTES**

*Scott Haggerty, Chair*  
Alameda County

*Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*Dean J. Chu*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Dave Cortese*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Chris Daly*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacomini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sue Lempert*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Jon Rubin*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Amy Worth*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Ken Yeager*  
Santa Clara County

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director,  
Bay Area Toll Authority

*Therese W. McMillan*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

**ATTENDANCE**

Commissioner Spering called the Planning Committee meeting to order at 9 a.m. Other members in attendance were Commissioners Azumbrado, Chu, Giacomini, Halsted, Lempert, Yeager, and Tissier.

**CONSENT CALENDAR: Minutes of February 13, 2009**

Commissioner Worth moved approval, Commissioner Halsted seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

**TRANSPORTATION 2035: Postponement of Plan Adoption**

Ms. Ashley Nguyen brought the Committee's attention to the staff report showing the revised plan adoption schedule for the Transportation 2035 Plan, a letter from VTA, as well as a packet of comments received on the Draft Plan. These items are available to view on MTC's website.

Ms. Nguyen reported that staff is proposing to postpone the adoption of the Transportation 2035 Plan to allow for additional time to prepare revisions to the Draft Plan. The revisions will specifically address new information about VTA's Measure A Transit Program as well as funding changes for transit operations, specifically looking at state budget actions that involved cuts to the State Transit Assistance (STA) funds.

Ms. Ashley Nguyen outlined the revised plan adoption schedule, as follows:

- Staff will present the revisions to the Draft Plan at the March 25, 2009 Commission meeting, which will be the date of the start of the public comment period.
- The 14-day public comment period will close on April 8, 2009 at 4 p.m.
- Staff will request the Planning Committee's approval and referral to the Commission on three items at the April 10, 2009 meeting: (1) approval of the Conformity Analysis, (2) certification of Final EIR, and (3) the adoption of the Final Plan.
- The Commission will be asked to take final action on these same three items at its April 22, 2009 meeting.

Commissioner Lempert asked if this is an unusual step to delay the Plan. Mr. Steve Heminger confirmed that it is an unusual step, but the fact is that the new information from VTA is significant enough to require staff to reconfigure what the Plan looks like. He stated that staff's 25-year revenue forecasts for the Plan are very sensitive to the base year; we are now in a worse economic environment than when the current Plan forecasts were developed and we need to assess how this situation affects those forecasts.

Commissioner Lempert also asked if these new projections will jeopardize these projects in terms of getting money from Washington. She also expressed interest on the impact on the Dumbarton Rail transfer of money, because a part of that transfer went to BART/San Jose extension project; if this project were no longer financially viable, does it open up the whole question of that transfer or Regional Measure 2 revenues? Mr. Heminger replied that the answer to the question regarding Dumbarton Rail transfer is no. He commented on VTA's developments, which are 1) the estimated costs of the full BART extension to Santa Clara County is higher, and 2) the estimated local sales tax revenue to cover that cost is lower. He noted that what VTA is suggesting that there are ways to cover the increase cost and the drop in revenue, and that's one reason why staff is delaying adoption of the Plan. Mr. Heminger stated that it is clear, that even with the increase in cost and reduction in revenue, there is sufficient revenue to build the federal segment, which is the BART extension to the proposed Berryessa station in Santa Clara County. He noted that both VTA and MTC would like to move forward with the complete BART extension to San Jose.

Commissioner Worth noted that Contra Costa Transportation Authority is looking into its own sales tax projections, and asked if the VTA situation was applicable to all other sales tax authorities. Mr. Heminger replied that thus far VTA is the only agency to produce new 25-year projections. He noted that the other authorities are looking at the projections in terms of the next few years but that they haven't produced new 25-year projections. He stated that staff will be conferring with Contra Costa Transportation Authority on its recent sales tax analysis. He also mentioned that staff will be looking at its own projections of Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds, along with the projections for the State Transit Assistance (STA) funds.

Commissioner Azumbrado commented on the projections and asked how much are they based on the current recession, do the projections say how long the recession will last, or do the projections go beyond that? Mr.

**OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT**

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 9:15 a.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, April 10, 2009 at 9:00 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.